

**THE JESUIT PRESENCE
IN THE ORIGINS OF THE CONGREGATION OF OUR LADY OF SION**

Paper presented on July 11, 2012 by Audrey Doetzel, NDS
at the international conference:

**"THE TRAGIC COUPLE": ENCOUNTERS BETWEEN JEWS AND JESUITS
July 9-13, 2012 at Boston College**

Panel: *Hateful Visions: Hopeful Encounters*

The Congregation of Our Lady of Sion is a community of religious women founded in the mid-nineteenth century in Paris, France by Theodore Ratisbonne. During this time Theodore also founded a small community of Fathers of Sion which today is a community of priests and brothers known as The Congregation of the Religious of Our Lady of Sion. While establishing these two foundations Theodore was inspired and assisted by an experience and the efforts of his youngest brother Alphonse. During these years there was a noteworthy relationship between the Ratisbonne brothers and Jesuits in Rome and in France.

Following a brief introduction to the Ratisbonne family, the historic and cultural context, and the founding of Sion, this essay traces these Jesuit relationships with the Ratisbonne brothers, particularly with Alphonse. Following this overview, the essay briefly comments on notable Jesuit involvements with Sion in the mid-twentieth and early twenty-first centuries. The essay relies primarily on the seven-volume *Origins of Sion*, printed between 1966 and 1981 by Tipographia Poliglotta Della Pontificia Università Gregoriana. The volumes consist mainly of memoirs, writings, sermons and letters by Theodore.¹

The Ratisbonne family took its name from the town in Bavaria from which it emigrated in the eighteenth century to settle in Alsace. In the following century Louis and Auguste Ratisbonne founded in Strasbourg a bank which prospered greatly due to their competence and honesty. Theodore (born in 1802) and Alphonse (born in 1814) were the sons of Auguste. Their mother was Adelaide Cerfbeer, grand-daughter of Naftali (Herz) Cerfbeer, a French Jewish philanthropist and pioneer in the emancipation of Jews at the time of the French Revolution. In opposition to the authorities of Strasbourg, the government allowed him to settle there in return for service rendered to the government during the 1770-71 famine. Unlike Jews in other parts of France at the time, the Jews in Alsace were still enclosed in ghettos, destitute, and harassed in many ways.² Cerfbeer employed his wealth and influence to promote the material and spiritual welfare of the Jews in Strasbourg and in Alsace.³ The wealthy and privileged family of Auguste Ratisbonne continued Cerfbeer's philanthropic tradition.

Part of the Alsatian Ashkenazi community, the Ratisbottes were among a minority of wealthy Jews who, influenced by the Enlightenment, sought to bring Judaism in contact with non-Jewish European thought and culture. Interacting with non-Jewish French society, some drifted completely from their own tradition. Others, like the Ratisbottes, valued their cultural identity and were

committed to the welfare of the Jewish community, while increasingly detached from religious belief and practice. Thus, both Theodore and Alphonse could be described as agnostic Jews. At their birth they met intellectual and religious confusion on two fronts: the cultural breakdown in wake of the Enlightenment and the Revolution, and the Jewish fundamental questioning of and detachment from its traditional values.

Challenged by this reality, young Theodore experienced a nine-year search during which he grappled with the meaninglessness of life. Influenced in turn by rationalism and romanticism, he became disenchanted with the academic, experiencing a deep malaise. In his *Memoirs* he speaks of his “insurmountable need to love”⁴ and his sense of some hidden mystery: “Something mysterious was going on in my soul. I lived without any religion and I sought neither good nor evil, but I often said, ‘I am twenty years old and I do not know why I exist. What is the purpose of my life here on earth?’”⁵ Several years later he exclaimed, “O God, if you really exist, show me the truth and I promise at this moment to devote my life to searching for it.”⁶ In 1823, while studying law in Strasbourg, his search led him to two Catholic mentors, Louise Humann and the philosopher, Louis Bautain. In 1827, after four years of prayer and study of truths drawn out “from the living source of Holy Scripture,”⁷ he embraced Catholicism and was baptized by Miss Humann.⁸ This experience had led him away from the rational, to the God of truth who had touched his heart in love. His response was to love and in that love to know truth. His deep appreciation for finding truth and love in his experience of Catholicism compelled him to desire this same gift for his family, indeed, for all ‘the lost sheep of the House of Israel’: “My soul needed to share with the children of Israel the overflowing of peace, of light and of happiness which I myself had found in accepting Christian revelation.”⁹ This desire accompanied him to his ordination, and eventually to his work as assistant director of the Archconfraternity of Our Lady of Victories,¹⁰ while assistant at the Church of Notre Dame des Victoires in Paris. Through the Archconfraternity he was in contact with Protestants, Jews, and atheists. This corresponded to his most secret aspiration, since the Archconfraternity included the conversion of Jews in its prayers and efforts. His work at Notre Dame des Victoires eventually led him to Providence House where he provided free chaplaincy services for more than three hundred orphans. During this time, in response to his sense of being called to work for the material and spiritual welfare of his people, he began a catechumenate for young Jewish girls confided to him by their parents. It was this work with the catechumenate that eventually led to founding the Sisters of Our Lady of Zion. Understood in the social context of early nineteenth century Paris, Theodore’s aim in starting the catechumenate was not merely religious, but motivated also by the deprivation, physical and moral distress of the Jewish working class. These social circumstances played a major part in the origins of Zion.¹¹

In 1842, while at Providence House, Theodore was profoundly influenced by an experience of his youngest brother Alphonse. His embrace of Catholicism had temporarily alienated Theodore from his family. Alphonse, in mid-adolescence, was particularly traumatized and angered by the action of this loved sibling. He strongly opposed Theodore and ceased communicating with him. Later in life, Alphonse wrote: “[Theodore] continued his relationship with the rest of the family; as for me, I never wished to see him again.”¹²

Alphonse was of a less serious nature than Theodore. Though he followed literary, scientific and legal studies in Strasbourg and Paris — and had been chosen to become head of the Ratisbonne bank — this spoiled “child-king” of the family was playful, sensitive, and spontaneous. Showered with wealth by his uncle, he later said of himself: “[T]he only thing I liked was pleasure; ...I believed that we were in this world to enjoy ourselves... [A]ll I thought of was a good time and enjoyment and I threw myself passionately into this kind of life.”¹³ However, as Theodore had done before him, Alphonse became zealously committed to the Society for the Encouragement of Work among Young Jews, the aim of which was to help the cause of its oppressed people and to obtain for them perfect equality of rights as

well as a more complete fusion with the rest of society.¹⁴ Later in life Alphonse stated: "I worked hard to improve the lot of my poor co-religionists, although I had no religion."¹⁵ He lived, he said, "without any religion, even without belief in God, but ...according to the inspirations of natural morality, especially the ideals of charity and compassion which I experienced in my heart."¹⁶

In early 1842, while engaged and waiting for his wedding, he embarked on travel to Naples, Malta, and the Near East. On January 1, while in Naples, he wrote: "I asked God for some inspiration to guide me in my plans for the improvement of the lot of the Jews, a thought which continually haunted me."¹⁷ Whether due to distraction, his spontaneous nature, or some other mysterious influence, when intending to take the coach to Palermo he took a coach to Rome instead, arriving there on January 5, the eve of Epiphany. Here, while seeking out the ancient and modern ruins and visiting the churches of Rome, he made the acquaintance of Theodore's friend, Baron Theodore de Bussierre, who was a recent convert from Protestantism.

Almost immediately upon his arrival in Rome, Alphonse encountered overt efforts to convert him to Catholicism. Baron de Bussierre, strongly motivated by his own recent conversion, was particularly aggressive in this regard. Prayers from others were also solicited to this end. This was consistent with the climate of spiritual renewal at the time. It was a climate within which reaction to eighteenth-century rationalism and the revolutionary era spawned numerous and well-publicized conversions.¹⁸ Fervently Christian, people longed for the absolute, "a longing increased by the void in a society from which God had been banished."¹⁹ Among Catholics, profoundly persuaded that 'outside the Church there is no salvation,' there was a narrow, absolutist attitude which stressed the negative aspects of other religions. Judaism was most misunderstood and its continued validity denied by many.

Though Alphonse later wrote: "God allowed my whole life until the moment of my conversion to be one long series of anti-Christian acts,"²⁰ one encounters in *Origins* few displays of this negative attitude prior to his arrival in Rome. Other than his understandable anger and sense of betrayal at the time of his brother's conversion, hostility and negativity do not appear in keeping with his carefree manner and the charity and compassion he espoused. In Rome, however, though always polite, his observations and responses become increasingly negative and vehement. This would appear to be in reaction to the intense and aggressive conversionist efforts, particularly by Baron de Bussierre, about which he remarks: "I said to myself that if anything could drive a man away from religion, it would be the very persistence with which people were trying to convert him."²¹ Upon seeing the misery of the ghetto in Rome, he wrote: "[I]s this the charity which Rome preaches so loudly? I shuddered with horror, and I wondered whether if, for having killed a man eighteen centuries ago, an entire people deserved such treatment and such innumerable restrictions."²² He further notes that the sight of this misery "has re-awakened my hatred of Catholics and Catholicism; I prefer to be among the persecuted rather than the persecutors."²³ He conveys a state of increasing agitation with his words: "I maintained a mocking attitude, sometimes adding blasphemies against Christianity; my words matched the dispositions of my soul."²⁴

On January 15 Baron de Bussierre, seeking help in his discussions with Alphonse, told Jesuit Father Philippe de Villefort about Alphonse. De Villefort encouraged the Baron to persuade Alphonse to prolong his visit to Rome, to bring him to the Gesù and to introduce him to Father Jean Rozaven. De Villefort was deputy of the general secretariat of the Society.²⁵ Rozaven was Assistant General for the French province who had been delegated by the Superior General of the Society, Father Jean Roothan, to contact Alphonse.²⁶ Roothan, a member of the Archconfraternity, knew Theodore Ratisbonne. In 1941 Roothan had the whole Society enrolled in the Archconfraternity since "its purpose seemed to him in complete harmony with that of the Society."²⁷ He himself "was united in spirit each day to its

members at the time of their meetings.”²⁸ Archconfraternity baptisms were often administered by the Jesuits.²⁹

The following day de Bussierre took Alphonse to the Gesù where, when told that they were in a Jesuit church, Alphonse “showed his dislike for this Order by a gesture of contempt.” In response to de Bussierre’s persistence, Alphonse became visibly upset. However, when Father Rozaven made an appointment for him for that same evening, Alphonse kept the appointment.³⁰ De Villefort later testified that, out of respect for the Jesuits, Alphonse did not express any opposition to his and Father Rozaven’s arguments, even when Rozaven informed him “that the Jewish religion no longer existed” and that “he ought to pray to God for light.” Rozaven continued to inform him that “the Christian religion was quite simply the faithful fulfillment of the Old Testament promises” and then urged him to read the New Testament.³¹ The following days de Villefort and Rozaven had further conversations with Alphonse about which de Villefort noted that “the Jew seemed to be quite disposed to listen...mostly...to be polite and because he was well brought up.”³²

The morning of January 20 Alphonse came to the Gesù to see de Villefort, saying that he was restless and had been unable to sleep. De Villefort took him to the chapel of St. Ignatius and asked him to kneel down before the altar. However, “he turned his back...with an expression of unutterable repulsion.” After this he was with Father Rozaven until noon.³³ It is interesting to note that, in later testimony, Alphonse never mentions these conversations he had with Fathers de Villefort and Rozaven. They seemed to have “slid over him without any effect.”³⁴

Later that day Baron de Bussierre met Alphonse on the street and asked him to accompany him to the church of Sant’Andrea della Fratte where the Baron left him to make funeral arrangements for a friend. Alphonse later recounts:

As I walked about the church..., I was overcome by sudden agitation and I saw that I was enveloped in a kind of veil; the church seemed to me to have become dark except for a single chapel where all the light seemed to be concentrated. Raising my eyes to this chapel radiant with light, I saw standing on the altar, tall, vibrant, majestic, full of beauty and mercy, the Blessed Virgin Mary as she is represented on the Miraculous Medal of the Immaculate Conception.³⁵

Upon his return to the church de Bussierre found Alphonse on his knees, overcome with tears. To the Baron’s question: “What did you see?” Alphonse responded: “I cannot tell you. Take me to a confessor and I shall tell him on my knees if he will permit it.”³⁶ Alphonse later relates: “He took me to the Gesù to Father de Villefort...to whom I described the event...Afterwards we saw...the Superior General and Father Rozaven.”³⁷ Alphonse later spoke of the seeds contained in this graced experience of January 20, 1842 as: “the coming into being of the two Congregations of the Fathers and Sisters of Our Lady of Sion, founded by his brother Theodore on his suggestion, to bear witness to God’s love for Israel, and their implantation in Jerusalem of which Alphonse was the pioneer.”³⁸ It was to a Jesuit, Father Philippe de Villefort, that Alphonse first described this transforming and enlightening experience.

Following the apparition on January 20, Alphonse lived with his godfather, Baron de Bussierre, while receiving instructions about Baptism and the Catholic religion from Father de Villefort at the Gesù. For three days preceding his baptism, he lived at the Gesù where Father Roothan saw him each morning and Father de Villefort guided him in a retreat. On January 31, he was baptized in the Church of the Gesù. Alphonse stated: “Father de Villefort thought that by January 31 I had been given enough instruction, and thus my burning desire to receive Holy Baptism and the other sacraments which followed was satisfied in a single day.”³⁹ De Villefort later declared that in the silence of the apparition, Alphonse had been “enlightened about all the mysteries of Our Lord Jesus Christ.”⁴⁰ In Alphonse’s own

words: "She didn't say anything to me but I understood everything."⁴¹ At his baptism he "would take no other name than Mary,"⁴² and was then known simply as Mary or Mary-Alphonse.

From February 11 to April 1, 1842 the Vicariate of Rome conducted an investigation of what it called "the event" of January 20. The investigating committee was struck by the 'marvelous unanimity' of the witnesses, and on June 3, 1842, the decree attesting to the authenticity of the miracle was published. Among the nine witnesses at the investigation were three Jesuits: Fathers Roothan, de Villefort and Rozaven.⁴³ Father Roothan's testimony provided a more nuanced explanation of Alphonse's instantaneous understanding of Christianity:

I saw that Mr. Ratisbonne was an educated man because, since he had gone to school with companions of different Christian denominations, he had been able to acquire the material and historical knowledge of many things referring to our Catholic faith; as for his sense of faith, after his conversion this sense appeared in him ardent and efficacious, making it possible for him to understand and retain everything he was told so that in a very few days he had more than sufficient instruction.⁴⁴

From the moment of his conversion, Alphonse confessed: "I wanted to bury myself in a Trappist monastery and to lose myself in the contemplation of the things of eternity."⁴⁵ However, his experience with the Jesuits led him in another direction.

Following his baptism Mary-Alphonse remained at the Gesù for another six weeks. He continued under the direction of Father de Villefort, making a second more extended retreat with the Exercises. On March 6 he made a brief visit to Paris to meet with Theodore and speak with him about the event of January 20 and the "interior knowledge that the grace which he had received must give rise to a work for the salvation of Israel."⁴⁶ He then went to Juilly for a period of two months to discern God's will in his regard.⁴⁷ During this time he was under the guidance of Jesuit Father Xavier de Ravignan who was serving in the pulpit of Notre Dame. De Ravignan had been Alphonse's confessor during his visit to Paris in March, after which he continued to discuss his vocation with him.⁴⁸ On April 7 de Ravignan wrote to the Jesuit General, Father Roothan: "Mary Ratisbonne...has opened his heart to me... [H]is conversations with me often express his deep desire to enter the Society. It seems to me that the requirement for a dispensation should present no obstacle if God makes his will clear. Will you...give me your opinion on this subject?"⁴⁹ Roothan responded: "If God is calling Alphonse Ratisbonne to the Society of Jesus (which would not surprise me; but I think it would be wise not to rush the decision) the request for the dispensation which, of course, must be addressed to the Holy Father, would certainly be granted to me and I should not refuse."⁵⁰ Mary-Alphonse himself wrote to Father Roothan: "[T]he impressions which absorbed me during my retreat both preceding and following my baptism in Rome have not faded; they have planted in my soul a seed which has consistently developed in an extraordinary fashion... If...you believe that this vocation comes from God, [I beg you to ask] the Holy Father to grant the dispensation I requested..."⁵¹ Clearly, "this step was the culmination of a whole series of events in which the Jesuits were involved since Alphonse had been introduced to them... on January 16, 1842."⁵²

On June 20, 1842, exactly five months after the "event" at Sant'Andrea della Fratte and even before the dispensation arrived, Mary-Alphonse entered the Jesuit novitiate at Toulouse. He continued his novitiate at St. Acheul, received the tonsure on November 18, 1843, and pronounced first vows on June 21, 1844. At the scholasticate at Laval, he received minor orders on September 29, 1845, the subdiaconate on March 18, 1848, and priestly ordination on September 23, 1848. On December 18, 1852, shortly before his final vows and after passing through "an agonizing crisis of conscience,"⁵³ he left the Jesuits to join his brother Theodore and to "renew his vow of obedience" to him as a Father of Sion. Just four days earlier, Pope Pius IX had given a Brief of praise to this new institute, in spite of its limited numbers, indicating that its foundation was his ardent wish.⁵⁴

Mary-Alphonse had expressed a two-fold goal when he joined the Society: “a life of obscurity lived in obedience” and “the apostolic life-stream which would transform his life into a total gift to the service of others and especially Israel.”⁵⁵ His eleven years with the Jesuits (January 20, 1842 to December 18, 1852) can be described as a time when the Jesuits cradled the neophyte and nurtured his new faith, sheltered him from undue publicity and the carnival of curiosity seekers, and faithfully guided his discernment regarding his “urgent desire to work for the salvation of Israel” —“the Work to which his conversion had given rise.”⁵⁶

Brother Mary immediately felt at home with the Jesuits. His first novice master, Father Ogerdias—whom Brother Mary described being ‘tender as a mother’—soon wrote: “[E]very day I admire Mary’s action in this soul;...he has great sincerity;...he acts with us as a real child, as if he had never done anything else.”⁵⁷ We read in *Origins* that Mary-Alphonse “was happy and radiant during the ten and a half years he spent [in the Order]. His relationships with his brothers and his superiors were always warm. He felt a deep affinity with the Ignatian spirit. He did not find the rule burdensome; on the contrary, his impetuous temperament found it a stabilizing factor.”⁵⁸ His letters to Father de Ravignan speak of his spiritual progress, the good examples which are always before him, and the excellent advice and encouragement he receives from the Reverend Master.⁵⁹ Hence, his departure from the Society “involved tearing apart a living part of himself, tearing himself away from the Society which he loved as it were at the gut level; he felt as closely bound to it as to a mother; had it not taken charge of him since his birth to the faith?”⁶⁰

Ignatius’ statement that he would have regarded being a member of the Jewish race a special grace resonated deeply in the soul of Mary-Alphonse.⁶¹ We hear as well that “[i]t was a great joy for the Jesuits to see the original idea of their Founder being realized by Father Mary...”⁶² Clearly, the Jesuits considered Alphonse’s identity as a convert from Judaism an asset rather than a liability. There are no indications of prejudice or discrimination. This is in sharp contrast to the experience of his brother Theodore during his studies in the seminary at Molsheim. *Origins* says about the Molsheim seminary: “The atmosphere there was anti-semitic: ‘the three young Jews (Ratisbonne, Goschler, Level) were rejected because of their Jewish origin, because prejudice was very much alive; some of their fellow-disciples did not want to be friendly even with converted Jews.’”⁶³ In Theodore’s words: “Several of my fellow students could not forgive me my Jewish religion and the religion of my fathers and yet I shared this origin with the apostles, the first disciples and all the primitive Church!”⁶⁴

In keeping with their General’s repeated counsel to “help this brother” and “not damage God’s work,”⁶⁵ the Jesuits wisely protected Mary-Alphonse whose sudden conversion had created a sensation in Rome and had spread rapidly throughout France and beyond the European borders. Efforts were made constantly to maintain normalcy and to shelter him from excessive adulation and curiosity seekers. When he entered the Toulouse novitiate, Father Roothan wrote to Father de Ravignan: “It is desirable that as little attention as possible be paid to him. Be good enough to tell this to Father Ogerdias...”⁶⁶ Ogerdias assured the Superior General: “His retreat is always respected; only two or three people have seen him since he has been with us...everywhere he is with his brothers, doing what they do without any privileges;...”⁶⁷ Mary-Alphonse is soon relocated to the more isolated novitiate at St. Acheul.⁶⁸

On three occasions Father Roothan asked the Provincials of Lyons and Paris to change Mary-Alphonse’s name. Hence, the registers of both Lyons and Paris refer to Brother Ratisbonne only as Alphonse-Mary.⁶⁹ When Father Desgenettes, from Notre Dame des Victoires in Paris, sent Roothan holy cards bearing Alphonse’s photo, Roothan responded: “I think this is going too far...Fortunately this novice is in an isolated spot and asks only to remain hidden in God.”⁷⁰ Mary-Alphonse himself sought

this isolation and non-exposure. When the opportunity was offered him to go to Paris for the inauguration of the chapel he had had built there in honor of Mary, he wrote to Father de Ravignan: "I have thought more carefully about this. There will be a crowd of people at the ceremony; perhaps I shall be the object of special attention; it seems to me that this would disturb the calm in which I am so happily living. I wonder whether this is the place for a novice of the Society."⁷¹ After his ordination, in order to avoid curiosity seekers, Father Mary celebrated his first Mass in the inner chapel of the scholasticate.⁷²

In November, 1852 Mary-Alphonse begins his letter to Father Roothan requesting dispensation from his vows by expressing "my filial love for our dear holy Society." He appears confident and at ease in expressing to his Father General that which has dominated his mind since his conversion: that of working for the 'regeneration and salvation' of his people.⁷³ This transparency reflects the nature of the Jesuits' relationship with this young 'son of Ignatius', their respect for an individual's Call from God, and the integrity of the discernment process through which Mary-Alphonse was guided by those entrusted with his spiritual formation.

From the outset, there was no hesitation in allowing Mary-Alphonse to communicate freely with Theodore, to participate when possible in the activities of Sion as the fledgling community took root and began to develop, and to welcome and host Theodore at his various Jesuit locations. Already prior to entering the novitiate, Mary-Alphonse had spoken to Theodore about giving definite form to his 'good work' by beginning a catechumenate for poor Jewish children entrusted to him by their parents. After Theodore submitted this plan to Pope Gregory XVI who approved it and to Father Roothan who encouraged it, he returned from Rome via Toulouse to discuss it further with the new novice, Brother Mary-Alphonse.⁷⁴ Mary-Alphonse then insisted that Theodore provide Christian education for these children, that he buy a house for this work, and that he act immediately.⁷⁵ "[I]n the wake of his enlightenment of January 20, [Mary-Alphonse's] thought often burst forth like that of a prophet. Gifted with intuition, he opened up pathways, suggested, insisted, gave the impetus. His function was to produce ideas, his brother's was to put them into action..."⁷⁶

Throughout his years with the Jesuits, Mary-Alphonse's heart was close to the growing Sion community. He frequently wrote to the neophytes, paid visits to the catechumenate and the small schools to which it gave rise, and encouraged the women working with the neophytes in their desire for religious life.⁷⁷ This interest and support was always expressed from within the context of his life as a Jesuit. He says: "[W]hatever may be the post given to me by my dear and venerated superiors, no thing will prevent me from cooperating in your labour by my poor prayers, by my insignificant sacrifices..." The day after his ordination he remarks: "However distant we may be from each other, although working under different banners, we are nevertheless working for the realization of the same hope and this unity of ideal and goal must unite us before God." Soon after his ordination he preached the retreat preceding the first Sion renewal of vows and the profession of the first five novices in 1849.⁷⁸ Upon beginning his tertianship his words verge on a prediction of the future: "This...year...will not be lost for Sion. The lights and new strength that I draw from it will be consecrated to cooperating one day with your work, either directly or indirectly."⁷⁹ After completing this tertianship year he was named to the residence at 35 rue de Sevres in Paris where the flexibility of his timetable and the proximity to the Sion residence allowed him to go often to the neophytat and the day schools. He frequently shared in the direction of the work and replaced Theodore when he was away on preaching engagements. *Origins* notes: "[T]here was nothing unusual in the fact that the Jesuits allowed him this freedom to collaborate with Theodore, had not Father Rubillon obtained permission from the Superior General for a Jesuit to lend his help to 'this excellent work'?"⁸⁰

The assistance and support Theodore and his brother received from the Jesuits regarding the nature of their Call enabled Theodore to encourage Father Mary's contact with the Sisters and the novices. Theodore states: "The venerable Father Roothan, foreseeing the fruits that [this work] would bear, blessed it with all his heart."⁸¹ On two occasions Theodore himself, convinced that he was not meant to be a diocesan priest, made retreats under the direction of Fathers Rubillon and Guidée with the hope of entering the Society.⁸² About this discernment Theodore remarked: "[Father Rubillon] carefully examined all the circumstances which had brought into being this work which was my chief preoccupation. He saw that it was providentially inspired and had the marks of God's will on it, and he assured me...that God's will was for me to remain at my post."⁸³ In his *Histoire d'un Siècle* Jesuit Father P. Burnichon says: "The Jesuits could only approve the realization of the idea of their Father (St. Ignatius) after three centuries, in the Society of Sion; they certainly helped it to progress by forming Father Mary to the religious life shortly after his conversion; they helped it still more when they refused to admit Father Theodore who wanted to be a Jesuit."⁸⁴ In a letter of June 25, 1845 the Superior General Father Roothan wrote: "Thank you Father for your faithful affection for our poor Society. If you cannot belong to it as your brother Alphonse Mary does, you belong to it in your heart and the '*Particeps ego sum*' will be yours in a special way."⁸⁵

This inability to join the Jesuits did not diminish Theodore's admiration for the quality of religious life and the spirit of the Jesuits. On several occasions he spent time with his brother Mary at a Jesuit residence, once while recovering from cholera and at other times simply to rest. In 1847 he stayed with Father Mary while the Jesuit Father Guidée assisted him in his work on the Constitutions for his new Congregation. In 1851 he stayed at Notre Dame de Liesse, where he and Father Mary received the assistance of Jesuit Father Fouillot in editing the 'Constitutive Plan' of the Congregation.⁸⁶

Given Father Mary's close relationship with the newly-emerging Sion community while a member of the Society of Jesus, it not surprising to hear of his agonizing crisis of conscience as he approached his fortieth birthday and his final vows. Should he remain faithful to the bonds by which he was so firmly attached to the Society, or should he join his brother in his work as a Father of Sion?

Contributing to this crisis and influencing his discernment was the Jesuit multiplication of their schools in France following the Falloux laws of 1850 and 1851 which aimed to promote Catholic education and to restore the quality of education in France. The Jesuit leadership needed to find personnel as they re-established their colleges and created new ones.⁸⁷ As he re-examined his vocation, Mary-Alphonse acknowledged his lack of aptitude as a scholar as well as his ineptitude with young people both on the scholastic level and the level of discipline. "Could he in clear conscience commit himself definitively to a ministry which he looked upon as impossible in view of his capabilities and irreconcilable with his personal vocation?" "Was [his] urgent desire to work for the salvation of Israel illusion or self-will?"⁸⁸

He brought these inner conflicts to his retreats of discernment within the Society. However, to ensure objectivity, he also spoke to Theodore who consulted with several Bishops and Archbishops. While the prelates "without a single exception...thought that the will of God was calling Father Mary to be with [Theodore] to develop the work which was his own inspiration, Theodore insisted that he would rather see Alphonse dead than outside the Society: "[I]t seemed to me before God, that my brother had been providentially trained in the Society to absorb the spirit, the vigour and the holy traditions of the religious life." However, Theodore later wrote: "The world's judgments are of little importance. Those who loudly criticized my brother for entering the society are now criticizing him just as loudly for leaving. But the only thing that matters is to know why God inspired him to enter and why He inspired him to leave."⁸⁹

Origins informs us that Mary-Alphonse's manner of departure from the Jesuits was somewhat unconventional. This 'true son of Ignatius,' due to the special circumstances stemming from his conversion and wanting to make his decision under the aegis of absolute obedience, asked his brother to submit his case to Pius IX.⁹⁰ The Pope responded that the will of God should be carried out without any human consideration. Theodore then delivered his brother's letter to the Jesuit General, Father Roothan. In it Mary-Alphonse again expressed his powerful attraction to propagate the knowledge of Jesus Christ among his brothers 'living in darkness.' After requesting release from his simple vows, the letter assured Father Roothan: "I shall always remain united to [the Society] in mind and heart...[A]lways consider me as one of your most devoted sons."⁹¹ When he read the letter Roothan appeared more sorrowful than surprised. Father Rubillon, in affirming Father Mary's decision, reminded Theodore of St. Philip Neri and Bishop de Belzunce, both of whom left the Society, one to establish the Oratorians, the other to become Bishop of Marseilles.⁹²

On his return from Rome, Theodore gave Mary-Alphonse an account of his audience with the Pope and with Father Roothan both of whom had given their oral consent to his departure from the Society. He presented to Mary-Alphonse two letters from Father Roothan, one for himself and the other for Father Studer, the Provincial of the French province whose canonical duty it was to release Alphonse from his vows. Father Studer, away from Paris at the time, did not receive the letter until several days later. Meanwhile, on December 18, the morning following Theodore's visit, Mary-Alphonse left his Jesuit residence at Vaugirard in Paris without waiting for his certificate of dismissal, without speaking to his local superior and the prefect of the College, and without saying good-bye to his brother Jesuits. He went directly to Sion at rue de Regard and renewed his vow of obedience to his brother as a Father of Sion.⁹³ Explanations offered for his manner of departure include: that the juridical process was never very important for him; that he had always lived under the sign of the immediacy of an action; that he believed he had all the necessary authorizations from the highest authorities; and that he was unable to cope with the tension between the joy of seeing his dream come true and the grief of having to break completely with the Society.⁹⁴

On December 31 Father Roothan expressed his paternal understanding of this unorthodox behavior in a letter to Father Martian who was in charge at the Vaugirard residence:

I had already been informed by his brother of Father Ratisbonne's decision in a letter written to me after a copy was presented to the Holy Father. I did not hesitate to give him his release. I made this clear to his brother, and it was probably on the strength of this that he acted as he did. He obviously made a mistake and he has to be classified as a fugitive. The Provincial must give him his release.⁹⁵

The day before the Superior General penned this letter to Martian, Mary-Alphonse had written to the General: "It seems to me that it is only now that I am in the vocation for which I have been formed for so many years; and it is with deep joy that I find myself in the position of being able to develop an apostolate for which St. Ignatius had the first idea."⁹⁶

The above clearly shows that there was more than a friendly relationship between the Jesuits and Sion. The Society had a significant influence on the burgeoning Sion Congregation — on Mary-Alphonse, on Theodore, and on the community. Mary-Alphonse continued to maintain a close relationship with his Jesuit brothers. In 1855, in fidelity to the hope of St. Ignatius, he left France to establish Sion in Jerusalem. From Jerusalem he wrote: "With all my heart I want to see the Society of Jesus in Jerusalem both for the good of the Holy Land and for the good of the Society. I shall take every opportunity to advance this enterprise."⁹⁷ In 1884, in *Annales de la mission de Notre Dame de Sion en Terre Sainte*, he wrote: "Throughout eternity I shall thank God for the immense grace He gave me for allowing me to spend eleven years in the Society of Jesus."⁹⁸ Theodore benefitted from the Jesuits' advice and support on numerous occasions. Moreover, he also had a spiritual affinity with the sons of St.

Ignatius in “trying like them to live only in the Absoluteness of Jesus Christ.” For him “[t]here is no need to seek any other line of spirituality: Christ is all, that is enough.”⁹⁹ (It is of interest to note that a study has drawn a comparison between the spiritualities of St. Ignatius and Father Theodore.)¹⁰⁰ Contacts between the Society and the Sion community continued. *Origins* notes:

Between 1844 and 1853, thirty-three Jesuits came to Sion, some of them several times. Jesuits preached retreats to the sisters,...celebrated Mass..., gave instructions, conferred baptism and heard confession. They came to pay visits to the Mother House, Grandbourg, [and the day schools]. In 1847 they asked Father Ratisbonne to found a house in Brussels, in 1848 in Algeria.¹⁰¹

Later Developments in Sion and in the Jesuit-Sion Relationship

Theodore Ratisbonne’s praxis and his exhortations to the Sisters in the mid-nineteenth century already signaled understandings which have now come to fuller expression in *Nostra Aetate*, §4 and in post-Vatican II theological developments and pastoral practices:

[Though] Theodore ardently desired his people to share his faith...[h]e was always on his guard against proselytism. Commenting on the words of Our Lord:...‘Every tree not planted by my Father will be uprooted’ – Matt. 15:13, he wrote in 1837, when he was only 35: ‘Whatever is not founded by God Himself will not endure; hence conversions brought about by human proselytism will not prosper.’¹⁰²

With a profound respect for the conscience of the individual, Theodore never brought pressure to bear on anyone and he carefully cautioned the Sisters about this. His motto regarding the work of Sion was: “Charity, which is its foundation, knows no boundaries or limits.”¹⁰³ “It can rightly be said that he was ahead of his time in his respect for all faiths. Contrary to the customs of his time, he wanted the houses of Sion to open their doors to pupils of all religions, and gave Catholics this advice: ‘Remain strong in the faith, but do not impose it on others.’”¹⁰⁴ His conviction that “Christianity was not a different religion from Judaism, but its continuation,”¹⁰⁵ foreshadows the opening statement of *Nostra Aetate*, §4:

As this sacred Synod searches into the mystery of the church, it recalls the spiritual bond linking the people of the new covenant with Abraham’s stock. For the church of Christ acknowledges that, according to the mystery of God’s saving design, the beginnings of her faith and her election are already found among the patriarchs, Moses, and the prophets.

It therefore not surprising that Sion’s expression of its charism quickly began to evolve and change. Already by 1850 conversionist activity had begun to decrease. The catechumenates were closed and boarding schools for girls of all faiths were opened. With the Sisters’ primary focus now on education, their knowledge of and experience with Jews and Judaism decreased considerably, and the specific apostolate regarding the Jewish people was now expressed mainly through “prayer formulas based on a...theology of substitution and atonement.”¹⁰⁶ However, in the twentieth century two major events had an impact within Sion which gave rise to an unequivocal demand for a major reappraisal of its vocation.¹⁰⁷

One of these events was the Holocaust during World War II. As Sisters in various parts of Europe took part in the resistance, sheltered Jewish children, and forged passports, a new self-understanding began to develop in the Congregation. The second event was the Biblical Movement which was felt in Sion through works such as those of Paul Démann and Gesa Vermes, two Fathers of Sion who provided theological and exegetical study and discussion of Judaism and Jewish-Christian relations, tracing the connection between the church and the children of Israel back to the Bible.¹⁰⁸ By 1951 the Superior General, Sister Felix, wrote: “Our special apostolate has to be completely readapted to the changed circumstances.”¹⁰⁹ By 1961 Vatican representatives expressed appreciation for these developments in

Sion and encouraged the sisters to increase their work for and with the Jewish people without any thought of conversion.¹¹⁰

The Congregation's preparation for its 1964 General Chapter coincided with the preparations for and the proceedings at Vatican Council II where the Jesuit Cardinal Augustin Bea had been charged with the Declaration on Catholic-Jewish Relations. During this time many Sion Sisters and communities were in contact with Council officials, providing relevant articles and dossiers to *periti* and Council Fathers. Council officials, including Cardinal Bea, were hosted at the Sion Generalate in Rome for discussion of the work of the Council regarding Jewish-Christian relations.¹¹¹ Hence, it came as no surprise that Sion leadership invited Cardinal Bea to address the Congregation during its 1964 General Chapter which focused primarily on reappraising and rearticulating the understanding and apostolic expression of the Sion charism. (There is a remarkable parallel between this event in the 1960s when a Jesuit was approached to provide insight and guidance as Sion revised its constitution and way of life, and the time in the mid-nineteenth century when Theodore and Mary-Alphonse Ratisbonne were assisted by two Jesuits, Fathers Guidée and Fouillot, as they drafted Sion's first rule and constitution.) Cardinal Bea's words made an indelible impression on the capitulars as he addressed proselytism's attempt "to convert without respecting the mysterious guidance of God who alone knows what is best for each soul," and emphasized that "a whole past of misunderstanding, of injustice,...of bloody persecution obliges Christians of today to treat Jews with the humility that makes reparation, asks pardon and seeks for reconciliation."¹¹² Reflecting on Sion's particular vocation and the Sisters' "special right" to speak of the Church's spiritual relationship with the Jews, he encouraged Sion to increase its apostolic efforts regarding Jews and Judaism. This was a prelude to his outreach to Sion immediately following the promulgation of *Nostra Aetate* on October 28, 1965, even before the close of the Council.

On November 13, 1965, the Cardinal with a group of other Council experts asked Sion to create a center in Rome which would help the teachings of *Nostra Aetate* become integrated into seminary courses, preaching, and catechetics and thus reach the mind and heart of the Christian world. Sion immediately established this Center in the Sion Generalate at via Garibaldi 28 then relocated it in 1970 to more spacious quarters on via del Plebiscito in the center of the city where it would be more accessible to the universities. Known as Service International de Documentation Judéo-Chrétienne (SIDIC), the Centre was a gathering place for dialogue, study and reflection. A library was established with books and journals on Jewish sources and history, on the history of Jewish-Christian relations, on the Shoah and post-Shoah philosophy and theology, and on *Nostra Aetate* and post-*Nostra Aetate* developments. Documentation on past and current developments in the Jewish-Christian relationship was gathered and categorized, some of which was published in the Center's journal, the SIDIC Review, which began publishing in English and French in 1967. Cardinal Bea and the Council experts involved with the founding of SIDIC designated as its first director Father Cornelius Rijk, the man Bea had chosen to be the first Secretary of the Vatican Commission charged with Christian-Jewish relations.

The SIDIC Center served in this capacity until the mid-1990s when Sion could no longer staff nor financially support SIDIC's expanding work. Given its collaboration with the Jesuit Gregorian University, SIDIC entered into a five-year discerning and negotiating process with Gregorian leadership in view of transferring SIDIC's resources and activities to the university which was creating its Institute for the Study of Religions and Cultures as well as the Cardinal Bea Center which would offer a program of Jewish Studies. An agreement was signed on May 14, 2002, and on October 15, 2002 the SIDIC Jewish-Christian resource library and documentation service was officially inaugurated at the Gregorian University—where the scholar Augustin Bea had taught biblical theology while rector of the Pontifical Biblical Institute.¹¹³

This SIDIC-Jesuit relationship is but one example—perhaps the most significant—of Jesuit-Sion relationships in numerous countries and through a rich variety of ministries. One might mention

Cardinal Martini, SJ offering retreats and lectures on Biblical Spirituality to Sion Sisters preparing for perpetual vows, Jesuits in Belo Horizonte providing intellectual formation for the young Sisters in Brazil, or the many collaborations throughout the world at academic levels, in retreat and parish ministries, through efforts for social justice, and today also through interfaith efforts with a unique focus on the Christian-Jewish relationship.

Viewing the above narrative in the context of the theme of this panel – *Hateful Visions: Hopeful Encounters* – begs the question: Is this a narrative of hate, or a narrative of hope? The Jesuit-Sion relationship in mid-nineteenth century France clearly was a blessed and hope-filled encounter which bore rich fruit into and throughout the twentieth century and continues to do so in this new millennium. The “visions” espoused by the Ratisbonnes and the Jesuits regarding Christianity and Judaism were not hate-filled. Their “visions,” inspired by hope and love, were juxtaposed against a dark and tragic history fueled by centuries-long Christian teachings of contempt rooted in the *Adversos Judaeos* literature of the church Fathers. As faithful “sons of the church,” both the Ratisbonnes and the Jesuits were forced to negotiate their understanding of Judaism vis-à-vis Christianity and Catholicism in the context of a supersessionist conversionist theology greatly influenced by reactionary and, at times, militant ideologies. Today, the Jesuits and Sion in a post-Vatican II context have the good fortune to carry forward the new relationships between Christians and Jews supported by the vision of *Nostra Aetate* which calls for reconciliation, understanding, respect and mutual enrichment rooted in our related yet distinct traditions of faith and culture.

ENDNOTES

¹ The work was collated, with introductions, commentaries and editings, by Sr. M. Carmelle, NDS and translated by Sr. Marian Dolan, NDS.

² See *Origins of Sion: Memoirs Supplement – Texts and Documents*, [*Memoirs Supplement*] compiled by Sr. Marie Alice, NDS, trans. Sr. Bernardine Kletzel, NDS (France: Les presses Monastiques, undated Supplement), 70-71. The Supplement is available in Sion archives in various international Sion locations.

³ See *Origins of Sion: Theodore Ratisbonne: Memoirs*, [*Memoirs*], p. 1. Undated publication, translated from the French edition of 1966 by Sister Marian Dolan, NDS. The English edition is available in various archives of the Congregation of Our Lady of Sion. The French edition is available from the Generalate of the Sisters of Sion, Via Garibaldi 28, Roma. See also *Wikipedia*, May 2012: http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Herz_cerfbeer_of_medelsheim. Wikipedia reference to: *Jewish Encyclopedia: 1901-1906*, Isidore Singer and Isaac Broyd , “Cerfbeer, Herz, of Medelsheim.”

⁴ *Memoirs*, 37.

⁵ *Ibid.*, 41.

⁶ *Ibid.*, 42.

⁷ Sr. Carmelle, NDS, *Theodore Ratisbonne: Journey by the Light of the Word: 1802-1884* [Journey], trans. Sr. Marian Dolan, NDS (Roma: Tipographia P.U.G., 1986), 9.

⁸ “With the Bishop’s consent, Louise Humann herself baptized Theodore privately without witnesses or any special ceremony, because his conversion was bound to create a stir.” *Journey*, 12.

⁹ *Memoirs*, 64-65.

¹⁰ Begun in 1836 as an Association for the conversion of sinners by Father Charles Desgenettes at Notre Dame des Victoires in Paris, the Association was declared an Archconfraternity in 1838 by Pope Gregory XVI.

¹¹ See *Memoirs Supplement*, 77-78.

¹² Sr. M. Carmelle, *The Event of January 20, 1842: Mary-Alphonse Ratisbonne* [*The Event*], trans. Sr. Marian Dolan (Roma: Tipographia P.U.G., 1977), 39.

¹³ *Ibid.*, 38.

-
- ¹⁴ See *Ibid.*, 38. Among Alsace Jews and their friends, the phrase “for the regeneration of Israel” was common, since the wretched and impoverished situation of the Jews was so obvious. See *Ibid.*, 61, Note (a).
- ¹⁵ *Ibid.*, 38.
- ¹⁶ *Ibid.*, 19.
- ¹⁷ *Ibid.*, 61.
- ¹⁸ See *Ibid.*, 61.
- ¹⁹ *Memoirs Supplement*, 75.
- ²⁰ *The Event*, 16.
- ²¹ *Ibid.*, 144.
- ²² *Ibid.*, 134.
- ²³ *Ibid.*, 17.
- ²⁴ *Ibid.*, 22.
- ²⁵ *The Event*, 182.
- ²⁶ *Ibid.*, 180.
- ²⁷ See *Ibid.*, 179-180.
- ²⁸ *Ibid.*, 43 – referencing G. de Vaux, S.J., and H. Riondel, S.J., *Vie du Père Jean Roothan, 1783-1853*, Paris, 1935, p. 174-177.
- ²⁹ See Sr. M. Carmelle, *Origins of Sion: Book 2 – Theodore Ratisbonne: Correspondence and Documents 1840-1853 [Origins 2]*, trans. Sr. Marian Dolan (Roma: Tipographia P.U.G., 1977), 15.
- ³⁰ See *The Event*, 139, and Footnote (a), 140.
- ³¹ See *Ibid.*, 140-141, including Footnote (b), 140.
- ³² *Ibid.*, 142, footnote (a).
- ³³ See *Ibid.*, 146.
- ³⁴ See *Ibid.*, 141, footnote (a).
- ³⁵ *The Event*, 25,
- ³⁶ *Ibid.*, 26.
- ³⁷ *Ibid.*, 26.
- ³⁸ Sr. Carmelle, NDS, *Alphonse Ratisbonne: From Rome to Jerusalem [Rome to Jerusalem]*, trans. Sr. Marian Dolan, NDS (Tipographia P.U.G., Roma, 1981), 13-14.
- ³⁹ *The Event*, 29.
- ⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, 53.
- ⁴¹ *Rome to Jerusalem*, 12,
- ⁴² *Ibid.*, 15.
- ⁴³ See *The Event*, 31. All the statements made during the investigation are in *Procès Ratisbonne*. This French translation and copies of the original Italian manuscript are in the Sion archives in Rome.
- ⁴⁴ *Rome to Jerusalem*, 13.
- ⁴⁵ *The Event*, 71.
- ⁴⁶ *Ibid.*, 95.
- ⁴⁷ See *Ibid.*, 75.
- ⁴⁸ See *Ibid.*, 75.
- ⁴⁹ *Ibid.*, 75-76.
- ⁵⁰ *Ibid.*, 76. At this time postulants of Jewish or Muslim origin could be admitted to the Society only with a personal dispensation from the Pope. See *The Event*, 77.
- ⁵¹ *Ibid.*, 76.
- ⁵² *Ibid.*, 76.
- ⁵³ *Ibid.*, 83.
- ⁵⁴ *Rome to Jerusalem*, 30.
- ⁵⁵ *The Event*, 76-77.
- ⁵⁶ *Ibid.*, 83; 81.
- ⁵⁷ *Ibid.*, 77-78 – Letter from Fr. Ogerdias, November 17, 1842. Jesuit archives, Chantilly.
- ⁵⁸ *Ibid.*, 79.

-
- ⁵⁹ See *Ibid.*, 80.
- ⁶⁰ *Ibid.*, 88.
- ⁶¹ See *Ibid.*, 77.
- ⁶² *Ibid.*, 77.
- ⁶³ Sr. M. Carmelle, *Origins of Sion: Book 1 –Theodore Ratisbonne: Early Writings 1825-1840 [Origins 1]*, trans. Sr. Marian Dolan (Roma: Tipographia P.U.G., 1978), 208, Note 6 – referencing Mrs. Paul Fliche: *Miss L.H. Humann*, p. 129, Paris, 1921.
- ⁶⁴ *Ibid.*, Adeodat, 132.
- ⁶⁵ *The Event*, 79.
- ⁶⁶ *Ibid.*, 79.
- ⁶⁷ *Ibid.*, 80 – Letter of November 10, 1842. Jesuit Archives, Rome, Lyons’ rule 2-XVIII-24.
- ⁶⁸ *Ibid.*, 79.
- ⁶⁹ *Ibid.*, 79-80.
- ⁷⁰ *Ibid.*, 80 – Letter of Dec. 20, 1842. Jesuit archives, Rome, Letter to Outsiders.
- ⁷¹ *Ibid.*, 80 – Letter of Nov. 17, 1842, Jesuit Archives, Chantilly.
- ⁷² See *Ibid.*, 78.
- ⁷³ See *The Event*, 85. This letter is in the Jesuit archives in Rome, Fr. reg. 8-XII-3, nos. 25,26,27.
- ⁷⁴ See *Ibid.*, 95.
- ⁷⁵ See *Book 2*, 21-22.
- ⁷⁶ *The Event*, 97.
- ⁷⁷ See *Ibid.*, 96-97.
- ⁷⁸ *Ibid.*, 96.
- ⁷⁹ See *Ibid.*, 96.
- ⁸⁰ *Ibid.*, 82.
- ⁸¹ *Book 2*, 21.
- ⁸² See *Ibid.*, 210.
- ⁸³ *Memoirs*, 113.
- ⁸⁴ *Book 2*, 210-211, quoting P. Burnichon, S.J., *La Compagnie de Jésus en France, Histoire d’un siècle, 1814-1914, t. 2, p. 420*.
- ⁸⁵ *Ibid.*, 217.
- ⁸⁶ See *Ibid.*, 50; 211.
- ⁸⁷ See *The Event*, 82.
- ⁸⁸ See *Ibid.*, 81-83.
- ⁸⁹ *Ibid.*, 84; *Origins 2*, 285.
- ⁹⁰ See *Ibid.*, 84
- ⁹¹ See *Ibid.*, 85-86. The manuscript is in the Jesuit archives in Rome, Fr. reg. 8-XII-3, nos. 25,26,27.
- ⁹² See *Ibid.*, 86.
- ⁹³ See *The Event*, 86-88.
- ⁹⁴ See *ibid.*, 87-88.
- ⁹⁵ *Ibid.*, 93, Note (4b). This letter of December 31, 1852 from Father Roothan to Father Martian is in the Jesuit archives, Rome, Fr. rule IV, p. 159.
- ⁹⁶ *Ibid.*, 88. Letter to Fr. Roothan, December 30, 1852. Jesuit archives, Rome, Fr. reg. 8-XII-4, 28.
- ⁹⁷ *The Event*, 89. Letter from Alphonse to Sr. Marie-Paul, fourth Superior General of Sion, March 18, 1883.
- ⁹⁸ *Rome to Jerusalem*, 30 — quoting *Annales de la mission de Notre Dame de Sion en Terre Sainte*, no. 29, June 1884, p. 95.
- ⁹⁹ *Book 2*, 211
- ¹⁰⁰ *Ibid.*, 212, Note (6) mentions the work of Sister Maryvonne Roquebert who drew this comparison. Her work is in the Sion archives.
- ¹⁰¹ *Ibid.*, 210.
- ¹⁰² *Supplement*, 76.
- ¹⁰³ *Book 2*, 323.

¹⁰⁴ Ibid., 76.

¹⁰⁵ Ibid., 76

¹⁰⁶ See Charlotte Klein, “From Conversion to Dialogue—The Sisters of Sion and the Jews: A Paradigm of Catholic-Jewish Relations” in *Journal of Ecumenical Studies*, 18:3, Summer 1981, 390-391.

¹⁰⁷ See Ibid., 391-392.

¹⁰⁸ Emma Green, “Developing Dialogue: The Congregation of Our Lady of Sion and *Nostra Aetate*, 1945-1969” in *Ecumenical Trends*, February 2012, p. 25. Paul Démann was founder of the periodical *Cahiers Sioniens* and author of the book *The Jewish Faith* (1961; French ed. 1959.) Démann and Vermes had Jewish backgrounds and both eventually left the Order and converted back to Judaism.

¹⁰⁹ Klein, 392.

¹¹⁰ See Klein, 394.

¹¹¹ See Green, 26-28.

¹¹² For the full text of Cardinal Bea’s 1964 address to the Sion General Chapter, see *Cardinal Bea aux Religieuses de N.D. de Sion*, 15 Janv. 1964. Printed privately. In Sion archives in Rome and Paris.

¹¹³ The *SIDIC Review* ceased publication in 2003. It is of interest to note that the electronic journal, *Studies in Christian-Relations* – which was begun in 2005 and which might be considered the *SIDIC Review*’s more academic successor – is published at a Jesuit university, Boston College.